

Heritage Advisory Committee Minutes

Date: Thursday, March 16, 2017
Location: Knox Mountain Meeting Room (#4A)
City Hall, 1435 Water Street

Committee Members Present: Abigail Riley (Chair), Stoke Tonne, Brian Anderson and Lorri Dauncey

Committee Members Absent: Amanda Snyder, Ryan Esbjerg (Alternate) and Bob Haynes (Alternate)

Staff Present: Community Planning Supervisor, Ryan Roycroft; Planner, Trisa Brandt; Planner, Lydia Korolchuk*; and FOI-Legislative Coordinator, Sandi Horning

(* denotes partial attendance)

1. Call to Order

The Chair called the meeting to order at 12:03 p.m.

Opening remarks by the Chair regarding conduct of the meeting were read. The Chair noted that the applicant for HAP17-0001 is not present and confirmed that staff are expecting the applicant to attend. The Chair advised that the Committee would deal with Agenda items 3 and 4 first in order to give the applicant more time.

3. Minutes

Moved by Lorri Dauncey/Seconded by Brian Anderson

THAT the Minutes of the February 16, 2017 Heritage Advisory Committee meeting be adopted as circulated.

Carried

4. Update - Council Decisions

Staff:

- Advised that the Heritage Revitalization Agreement with respect to 1449 Ethel Street is on the March 20, 2017 Council Agenda for Initial consideration.
- Advised that the Heritage Alteration Permit for 370 Burne Avenue is on the March 21, 2017 Council Agenda for consideration.
- Advised that the Thomson Farm Bylaw was adopted on March 6, 2017.
- Advised that 1985 Knox Crescent was approved for the carriage house and HAP for the second story on the primary dwelling. However, during the Building Permit process, it was discovered that the primary dwelling foundation cannot support a second storey. As a result, the applicant has redesigned to a single storey and applied for a new HAP. This will be presented to the Committee at the April meeting.
- Advised that a Stop Work Order has been placed on 1989 Abbott Street as the building on the property has been largely demolished. The City is currently considering enforcement options against the property owner. Staff will keep the Committee advised as this matter moves forward.

2. Applications for Consideration

2.1 2210 Abbott Street, HAP17-0001 - Richard, Judith & Craig Mohr

Staff:

- Displayed a PowerPoint presentation summarizing the Heritage Alteration Permit application with respect to the form and character of semi-detached housing and detached accessory buildings, including variances for site coverage, height and setbacks.
- The subject property is "Early Suburban" style with a dominant block style of "Late Arts and Crafts".
- Advised that there are other flat roof and modern homes in the area.
- Advised that a Development Permit was previously approved on the lot for a duplex which included a variance for the height of the accessory building and setback variances.
- The project details include:
 - o Modern design;
 - o "Frank Lloyd Wright Falling Water" inspiration;
 - o Horizontal planes;
 - o Stone columns;
 - o Mix of stone, stucco and glass;
 - o Detached accessory building:
 - Two single car garages;
 - Two bonus rooms;
 - o Opaque stucco walls around property line.
- Advised that upon staff's review of the requested variances, it was noted that an additional variance was overlooked and is required, being a variance to the Lake Okanagan Sight Line.
- Confirmed that the variances being requested include:
 - o Semi-detached dwellings:
 - Height – 3 stories proposed, 2.5 required
 - Setback – 2.3m proposed, 4.5m required
 - o Accessory buildings:
 - Height – 5.95m proposed, 4.5m maximum
 - Setback – 1.2m proposed, 9.0m required
 - o Site Coverage – 62% proposed, 60% required

- Lake Okanagan Sight Line (adjacent property).
- Staff are seeking a recommendation to Council regarding HAP17-0001 with respect to:
 - Form and Character;
 - Heritage Conservation Area Guidelines;
 - Variances requested for:
 - Height;
 - Setbacks;
 - Site Coverage;
 - Lake Okanagan Sight Lines.
- Responded to questions from the Committee Members.
- Clarified the number of parking spaces proposed:
 - 4 for each unit (minimum required is 2 for each unit).
- Clarified the height variance as relating to the number of stories rather than maximum height of 9.5m.
- Displayed a number of renderings for the subject property.

HAC Discussion:

- Each Committee Member provided individual comments regarding the application.
- Expressed a concern regarding the accessory buildings and the severe impact to the streetscape.

Moved by Stoke Tonne/Seconded by Brian Anderson

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Council support Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. HAP17-0001 for the property located at 2210 Abbott Street for the form and character of semi-detached housing in the Heritage Conservation Area subject to considering breaking up the symmetry of the primary residence and the articulation of the building halves form both the lake and street.

Defeated

Abigail Riley and Lorri Dauncey – Opposed.

Moved by Brian Anderson/Seconded by Lorri Dauncey

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Council not support Heritage Permit Application No. HAP17-0001 for the property located at 2210 Abbott Street to:

- vary the maximum number of stories of a semi-detached dwelling from 2.5 stories permitted to 3 stories proposed;
- vary the minimum front yard setback for a detached accessory building from 9.0m permitted to 1.2m proposed;
- vary the minimum side yard setback for a flanking street from 4.5m permitted to 2.31m proposed;
- vary the maximum site coverage including buildings, driveways and parking from 60% permitted to 62.4% proposed;
- vary the maximum height of an accessory building from 4.5m permitted to 5.95m proposed; and
- vary the Lake Okanagan Sight Line (adjacent property).

Carried

Anecdotal Comments:

The Heritage Advisory Committee recommends revisions to the application in order to reduce the massing of the structures for consistency with the adjacent properties and to reduce the number of parking spaces proposed. The Heritage Advisory Committee is concerned that the accessory building is too large and pushes the project above what is acceptable in the Heritage Conservation area. The variances indicate a clear desire to do more than the zone allows and noted that without the detached accessory building, fewer variances would be required, which would include the site coverage and Okanagan Lake Site Line and minimum parking requirement would still be met.

5. Next Meeting

The next Committee meeting has been scheduled for April 20, 2017.

6. Termination of Meeting

The Chair declared the meeting terminated at 12:43 p.m.

Abigail Riley, Chair

/slh